



COLORADO
 Department of Transportation
 Office of the Chief Engineer

TO: SHOSHANA M. LEW, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
 FROM: MARKOS ATAMO, PE, CMA BRANCH MANAGER
 CC: STEPHEN HARELSON, PE, CHIEF ENGINEER SH
 DATE: 07/23/2020
 SUBJECT: AWARD TO LOW RESPONSIVE BIDDER C.R.S. 43-1-113 (16)
 PROJECT: STM M086-083 (23120) REGION 2 PUEBLO METRO ADA CURB RAMPS

Pursuant to C.R.S. 43-1-113(16), it has been determined that it's in the best financial and economic interest of the State to award Region 2's project STM M086-083 (23120) to the low bidder NORRA Concrete Construction Corporation (NORRA).

Project Description: This Region 2 project is at various locations in the City of Pueblo for the replacement of curb ramps to be ADA compliant. The project was solicited under a design bid build (low bid) project delivery method where only two bids were received with NORRA being the lowest responsive bidder.

Financial Impact: NORRA's low bid proposal totaled \$2,523,898.00 and the second low bid from Lobos Structures, LLC. totaled \$3,184,645.00 compared to the CDOT engineer's estimate of \$1,760,440.00. The project risks rejection by Statute since there were only two bidders and their proposals were 143.37% and 180.90% of the engineer's estimate. Region 2 has verified they have funding available for the award of the project to NORRA.

Cost Analysis: A comparison of previous ADA curb ramp projects shown below revealed the average price bid per ramp by NORRA to be only 4.61% higher than the previously awarded bid pricing. The engineering cost estimate did not include costs from past ADA projects as a comparison.

Project	# of Ramps	Bid Letting Date	Construction Cost Per Curb Ramp (Bid Items, F/A Items, CE & Ind.)
CR100-286 (22014)	55	10/27/2017	\$7,600.00
NHPP R100-287 (22022)	155	09/17/2018	\$8,900.00
CR100-315 (22581)	118	03/17/2019	\$13,300.00
CR100-314 (22580)	117	09/12/2019	\$20,100.00
CR100-318 (22797)	59	12/19/2019	\$10,060.00
STM 0252-469 (22383)	77	09/06/2018	\$13,989.00
Weighted average cost per ramp from above projects is:			*\$13,989.00
STM M086-083 (23120)	239	07/09/2020	*\$14,634.00 (4.61% higher)

In addition, an analysis of the bid schedule revealed that the bid line items identified below resulted in the overall bid from NORRA Concrete being more than 10% over CDOT's engineer's estimate for the project.

Bid Item Description	QTY	Unit	Unit Price Low Bid & Eng. Est.		Total Cost Difference	% Over Eng. Estimate
EROSION CONTROL(CURB RAMP)	198	EA	\$650.00	\$250.00	\$79,200.00	160%
CONCRETE CURB RAMPS	3489	SY	\$175.00	\$120.00	\$191,895.00	45.83%
MOBILIZATION	1	LS	\$377,555.00	\$213,211.00	\$164,344.00	77.08%
TRAFFIC CONTROL MANAGEMENT	216	DAY	\$1,100.00	\$600.00	\$108,000.00	83.33

The engineer's estimate for the above bid items was based on historical data from similar projects with comparable quantities. In verifying NORRA's bid offer, NORRA mentioned that the curb ramp work in small quantities at numerous locations contributed to their overall higher bid pricing. Higher bid pricing was received due to erosion control requirements for maintaining each worksite in accordance with the project specifications. In addition, traffic control management and mobilization costs were bid much higher as a result of the varying job sites the work is to be completed at. The ADA curb ramp upgrades will improve intersection and roadway safety throughout the region. It is imperative that this project be awarded as soon as possible. Re-advertisement would risk delaying these important ADA safety improvements.

Based on the cost analysis, EEMA and Region 2 consider NORRA's overall proposed bid pricing to be fair and reasonable.

Staff Review & Recommendation: Given the overall project dynamics mentioned above, re-advertisement of the project is unlikely to result in more competition or reduced pricing. The Region 2 Project Management Team's analysis and

recommendation to award the project is provided in the attached memorandum to this request. As a result, staff recommends proceeding with the award of the project to NORRA.

- I recommend award
- I do not recommend award


Markos Atamo (Jul 27, 2020 15:02 MDT)

Date 07/27/20

Markos Atamo, PE, CMA Branch Manager

- I authorize award of the referenced project
- I do not authorize award of the referenced project


Shoshana Lew (Jul 28, 2020 13:43 MDT)

Date 07/28/20

Shoshana M. Lew, Executive Director

cc: Stephen Bokros, EEMA Manager, Contract Market Analysis
Markos Atamo, Manager of Project Support
Jerad Esquibel, Director, Division of Project Support
RB Simmons, Engineering Contracts
Records Center



COLORADO
Department of Transportation
Region 2

5615 Wills Blvd.
Pueblo, CO 81008-2349

MEMORANDUM

TO: RB Simmons, Construction Contracts Manager
FROM: Jennifer Billings, Resident Engineer
DATE: July 15, 2020
SUBJECT: 23120 Project Award to Low Responsive Bidder, C.R.S. 43-1-113 (16)

This memorandum provides the Region 2 project team request to award project STM M086-083 (23120) along with the rationale on why it is in the best interest of the State to award the project. The primary elements for the project are removal and replacement of non-accessible corners and sidewalks with ADA complaint replacements throughout the city of Pueblo.

The project consists of:

- 239 ramps
- 7 highway corridors
- 35 temporary easements
- 52 traffic phases
- 220 working days

Per the requirements in the CDOT ADA transition plan and CDOT Procedural Directive 605.1, the project team utilized the curb ramp inventory, determined accessibility, prioritized locations, and prepared a PS&E that will bring CDOT and the city of Pueblo roadway system into compliance with ADA guidelines. The construction traffic phasing maintains pedestrian movements and the lane closures are limited to single lane short duration impacts.

The multiple phases and locations throughout Pueblo make the project challenging, but bundling all the ramps into one project saves CDOT in staffing and mobilization costs.

The work is truly only ramp related and there is no scope to cut. Removing ramps from the project would only result in the need for another project to meet the ADA program requirements.

Although the bids were above the engineer's estimate, the price per ramp was not unreasonable. The low bidder ramp price was \$10,177/ramp. Other projects that have been awarded have seen prices in the range of \$15,000/ramp.

The asset managers reviewed the bid tabulations and estimates and agree that there is no scope to reduce and that the price per ramp is acceptable.

The RTD has been informed of the bid results and concurs with moving forward to award the project.

Please feel free to contact me at 719-406-8510 if you have any questions or would like to further discuss this request.

